

CHATTANOOGA HISTORIC ZONING COMMISSION

MINUTES

May 21, 2020

The duly advertised meeting of the Chattanooga Historic Zoning Commission was held on May 21, 2020, at 9:30 a.m. electronically, via Zoom. Chair Steve Lewin called the meeting to order. Secretary Levi Witt called the roll and swore in all those who would be addressing the Commission. Chair Steve Lewin explained the rules of procedures and announced that the meeting is being recorded.

Members Present: Chair Steve Lewin, Vice Chair Melissa Mortimer, Matt McDonald, Hannah Forman, Skip Pond, Rachel Shannon and Lee Helena.

Members Absent:

Staff Members Present: Development Review Planner Sarah Robbins, Secretary Levi Witt, City Attorney Robert Robinson.

Applicants Present: Chris Anderson, R & P Homes, Anthony Shaw, Christopher Gehard, Clayton & Lisa Whittaker, Billy Stockwell, Sam Moore, Gary Fiser, Safaa Abou Alfa, Stuart Wood, Reflective Homes, Tommye Johnson, Daniel Lee, Case White, Bryan Youngblood, Garth Brown, Kevin Boehm, Kate Boehm, Jamie Pfeffer, Jonathan Torode, Mike Flanagan, John McWaters

Chairman Steve Lewin explained the rules of procedures.

Approval of Minutes: Melissa Mortimer made a motion to approve February 2020 meeting minutes. Steve Lewin seconded the motion. All in favor, the motion was unanimously approved.

OLD BUSINESS:

Case #20-HZ-00013 – 4912 Florida Avenue – New construction of a primary structure with attached garage, driveway, walkway and parking area

Project Description:

The applicant, Chris Anderson, has applied for the following work:

- New construction of a primary structure with attached garage.
- Concrete driveway, walkway and parking area.

Comments from the community: Applicant Chris Anderson spoke about the project and answered various questions from the Commission. Wendy Allison, owner of the home, also spoke about the project. There were two letters of opposition to the project,

from Tim McDonald and Susan Spence, and Sarah Robbins read them to the Commission. Community member Debbie Sue Przybysz spoke in opposition to the project. Denise Shaw, another member of the community, spoke in opposition to the project as well. Chris Anderson responded to comments from the community. Wendy Allison also responded to comments from the community.

Discussion: A discussion was had between the Commission members. Steve Lewin made a motion to deny Case 20-HZ-00013: 4912 Florida Avenue, as submitted pursuant to the Chattanooga City Code, Chapter 10, Article II, Section 10-15e and pursuant to the St. Elmo Design Guidelines, approval subject to any and all conditions. Melissa Mortimer seconded the motion. Matt McDonald opposed and 6 in favor, the motion carried to deny.

There were no conditions noted in the motion.

Case #20-HZ-00016 – 1620 W. 53rd Street – New construction of a primary structure with an attached garage, driveway, walkway and parking area

Project Description:

The applicant, R & P Homes, has applied for the following work:

- New construction of a primary structure
- Attached garage
- Driveway
- Walkway
- Parking area

Comments from the community: Applicant Devin Schnelle spoke about the project and answered various questions from the Commission about the project. Sarah Robbins read an email from Tim McDonald in opposition to the project. Community member Cat DeVos expressed her concerns about the project. Community member Debbie Sue Przybyz expressed her concerns about the project. Community member Diane Marble also expressed her concerns about the project.

Discussion: A discussion was had between the Commission members. Hannah Forman made a motion to approve Case 20-HZ-00016: 1620 W. 53rd Street, as submitted pursuant to the Chattanooga City Code, Chapter 10, Article II, Section 10-15e and pursuant to the St. Elmo Design Guidelines, approval subject to any and all conditions. Melissa Mortimer seconded the motion. All in favor, votes recorded by roll call, the motion carried to approve.

There were no conditions noted in the motion.

NEW BUSINESS:

Case #20-HZ-00023 – 841 Fortwood Street – New construction of a detached outbuilding

Project Description:

The applicant, Anthony Shaw, has applied for the following work:

- New construction of a two story accessory structure on a previous accessory structure location.

Comments from the community: Applicant Anthony Shaw spoke about the project. Mr. Shaw explained the project in further detail and answered various questions from the Commission about the project.

Discussion: A discussion was had between the Commission members. Skip Pond made a motion to approve Case 20-HZ-00023: 841 Fortwood Street, as submitted pursuant to the Chattanooga City Code, Chapter 10, Article II, Section 10-15e and pursuant to the Fort Wood Design Guidelines, approval subject to any and all conditions. Steve Lewin seconded the motion. All in favor, votes recorded by roll call, the motion carried to approve.

The following conditions were noted in the motion:

1. Front facade to be brick below the beltline. Siding to be above the beltline as specified in the application.

Case #20-HZ-00026 – 1222 W. 55th Street – Replacement of a non-historic carport with a new detached garage.

Project Description:

The applicant, Christopher Gehard, has applied for the following work:

- New construction (new secondary building)
- Parking areas

Comments from the community: Applicant Christopher Gehard spoke about the project. Mr. Gehard explained the project in further detail and answered various questions from the Commission about the project.

Discussion: A discussion was had between the Commission members. Hannah Forman made a motion to approve Case 20-HZ-00026: 1222 W. 55th Street, as submitted pursuant to the Chattanooga City Code, Chapter 10, Article II, Section 10-15e and pursuant to the St. Elmo Design Guidelines, approval subject to any and all conditions. Melissa Mortimer seconded the motion. All in favor, votes recorded by roll call, the motion carried to approve.

The following conditions were noted in the motion:

1. At least 3.5" trim around all doors and windows (including garage door) on all sides, not included in the drawing.
2. Specifications on garage door to be approved by staff when the door is chosen.
3. Window on the front of structure must meet the proportions set by the guidelines.
4. To be consistent in style with the existing house, siding could continue all the way to the roof on the front and rear of the structure. Board and batten, as proposed originally, is also acceptable.

Case #20-HZ-00040 – 846 Oak Street – New construction of a two-story accessory structure with parking pad, driveway, walkway, retaining wall and fence.

Project Description:

The applicants, Clayton & Lisa Whittaker, have applied for the following work:

- New construction of an accessory structure (two-story garage)
- Parking pad
- Driveway
- Retaining wall and fence
- Walkway

Comments from the community: Applicants Clayton & Lisa Whittaker spoke about the project. The two spoke about the project in further detail and answered various questions from the Commission about the project. Sarah Robbins read a letter of support for the project from the Fort Wood Neighborhood Association.

Discussion: A discussion was had between the Commission members. Skip Pond made a motion to approve Case 20-HZ-00040: 846 Oak Street as submitted pursuant to the Chattanooga City Code, Chapter 10, Article II, Section 10-15e and

pursuant to the Fort Wood Design Guidelines, approval subject to any and all conditions. Steve Lewin seconded the motion. All in favor, votes recorded by roll call, the motion carried to approve.

There were no conditions noted in the motion.

Case #20-HZ-00042 – 4500 Tennessee Avenue – New construction of a building addition.

Project Description:

The applicants, Billy Stockwell / J. Brewer and Associates, have applied for the following work:

- New construction (two-story garage)
- Parking pad
- Driveway
- Retaining wall & fence
- Walkway

Comments from the community: Applicant Billy Stockwell and property owner Sam Moore spoke about the project. Mr. Stockwell and Mr. Moore explained the project in further detail and answered various questions from the Commission about the project.

Discussion: A discussion was had between the Commission members. Case #20-HZ-00042: 4500 Tennessee Avenue was deferred at the applicant's request.

Case #20-HZ-00044 – 1309 W. 45th Street – New construction of a primary structure with driveway, walkway and parking pad.

Project Description:

The applicants, Gary and Debbie Fiser, have applied for the following work:

- New construction of a primary structure
- Driveway
- Parking pad
- Walkway

Comments from the community: Applicants Gary and Debbie Fiser spoke about the project. Mr. and Mrs. Fiser explained the project in further detail and answered questions from the Commission about the project.

Discussion: A discussion was had between the Commission members. Steve Lewin made a motion to approve Case 20-HZ-00044: 1309 W. 45th Street, as submitted pursuant to the Chattanooga City Code, Chapter 10, Article II, Section 10-15e and pursuant to the St. Elmo Design Guidelines, approval subject to any

and all conditions. Hannah Forman seconded the motion. All in favor, votes recorded by roll call, the motion carried to approve.

The following conditions were noted in the motion:

1. Maximum foundation height not to exceed 4' at any point.

Case #20-HZ-00045 – 106 Everett Street – New construction of a building addition.

Project Description:

The applicant, Stuart Wood, has applied for the following work:

- New construction of a building addition
- Siding material change
- Window material and placement changes
- Foundation repairs
- Repairs and new materials on front porch

Comments from the community: Applicant Stuart Wood explained the project in further detail and answered questions from the Commission about the project. Denise Shaw, an architect on the project, also spoke about the project.

Discussion: A discussion was had between the Commission members. Matt McDonald made a motion to approve Case 20-HZ-00045: 106 Everett Street, as submitted pursuant to the Chattanooga City Code, Chapter 10, Article II, Section 10-15e and pursuant to the St. Elmo Design Guidelines, approval subject to any and all conditions. Steve Lewin seconded the motion. Melissa Mortimer opposed and 6 in favor, votes recorded by roll call, the motion carried to approve.

The following conditions were noted in the motion:

1. Front gable that is original to have siding that is consistent with the bottom half of the house.

Case #20-HZ-00046 – 4607 Alabama Avenue – New construction of a primary structure with attached garage, driveway, walkway and parking area.

Project Description:

The applicant, Devin Schnelle, has applied for the following work:

- New construction of a primary structure
- Attached garage
- Concrete driveway
- Walkway
- Parking area

Comments from the community: Applicant Devin Schnelle spoke about the project and answered questions from the Commission about the project. Paul Wilkinson also

spoke about the project and explained the project in further detail. Sarah Robbins read letters in opposition to the project from community residents Tim McDonald, Alice Sikkema, Alison Van Winkle, Angela Fox and Fallon Skinner. Ms. Schnelle and Mr. Wilkinson responded to concerns from the community.

Discussion: A discussion was had between the Commission members. Melissa Mortimer made a motion to approve Case 20-HZ-00046: 4607 Alabama Avenue, as submitted pursuant to the Chattanooga City Code, Chapter 10, Article II, Section 10-15e and pursuant to the St. Elmo Design Guidelines, approval subject to any and all conditions. Melissa Mortimer seconded the motion. All in favor, votes recorded by roll call, the motion carried to approve.

The following conditions were noted in the motion:

1. Consistent siding used on primary, full elevations. Dormers may use a different material.
2. Solid wood front door.

Case #20-HZ-00057 – 4907 Beulah Avenue – New construction of a secondary building with parking area and fence.

Project Description:

The applicant, Tommye Johnson, has applied for the following work:

- New construction (new secondary building)
- Parking areas
- Fence

Comments from the community: Applicant Tommye Johnson spoke about the project and explained the project in further detail for the Commission.

Discussion: A discussion was had between the Commission members. Hannah Forman made a motion to approve Case 20-HZ-00057: 4907 Beulah Avenue, as submitted pursuant to the Chattanooga City Code, Chapter 10, Article II, Section 10-15e and pursuant to the St. Elmo Design Guidelines, approval subject to any and all conditions. Steve Lewin seconded the motion. All in favor, votes recorded by roll call, the motion carried to approve.

There were no conditions noted in the motion.

Case #20-HZ-00058 – 4709 Alabama Avenue – New construction of a primary structure with walkway.

Project Description:

The applicant, Daniel Lee, has applied for the following work:

- New construction of a primary structure
- Walkway

Comments from the community: Applicant Daniel Lee spoke about the project and answered questions from the Commission about the project.

Discussion: A discussion was had between the Commission members. Case #20-HZ-00058: 4709 Alabama Avenue was deferred at the applicant's request.

Case #20-HZ-00059 – 5507 Alabama Avenue – New construction of a primary structure.

Project Description:

The applicant, Bryan Youngblood / Green Turtle L.L.C., has applied for the following work:

- New construction of a primary structure
- Driveway
- Parking pad

Comments from the community: Sarah read a letter in opposition to the project from community member Nicole Arellano.

Discussion: A discussion was had between the Commission members. Melissa Mortimer made a motion to defer Case 20-HZ-00059: 5507 Alabama Avenue, as submitted pursuant to the Chattanooga City Code, Chapter 10, Article II, Section 10-15e and pursuant to the St. Elmo Design Guidelines, approval subject to any and all conditions. Steve Lewin seconded the motion. All in favor, votes recorded by roll call, the motion carried to approve.

There were no conditions noted in the motion.

Case #20-HZ-00061 – 4277 Westridge Road – New construction of a primary structure.

Project Description:

The applicant, Garth Brown / Pfeffer Torode Architecture, has applied for the following work:

- New construction of a primary structure
- Driveway
- Parking pad
- Concrete patio

Comments from the community: Applicant Garth Brown spoke about the project and answered questions from the Commission about the project. Sarah Robbins read letters in opposition to the project from community members Tim McDonald and Blake Cash. Denise Shaw spoke in opposition to the project and expressed her concerns about the project. Garth Brown responded and addressed the concerns from the community. Michael Flanagan, who is also associated with the project, joined Garth Brown in explaining details about the project.

Discussion: A discussion was had between the Commission members. Steve Lewin made a motion to approve Case 20-HZ-00061: 4277 Westridge Road, as submitted pursuant to the Chattanooga City Code, Chapter 10, Article II, Section 10-15e and pursuant to the St. Elmo Design Guidelines, approval subject to any and all conditions. Matt McDonald seconded the motion. All in favor, votes recorded by roll call, the motion carried to approve.

There were no conditions noted in the motion.

OTHER BUSINESS:

NEXT MEETING DATE: June 18, 2020 (application deadline is May 22, 2020 at 4 p.m.).

Steve Lewin made a motion to adjourn. Melissa Mortimer second the motion. All in favor, the motion was unanimously approved.

The meeting was adjourned at 3:30 p.m.

Steve Lewin, Chair

Date

Levi Witt, Secretary

Date